HUMAN TRAFFICKING AS A MODERN DAY SLAVERY”

By Arushi Agarwal
From Dharmashastra National Law University

ABSTRACT
“We came to the United States to find a better future, not to be prostitutes. No woman or child would want to be a sex slave and endure the evil that I have gone through. I am in fear for my life more than ever. I helped put these evil men in jail. Please help me. Please help us. Please do not let this happen to anyone else.” —Maria, trafficking survivor

One of the worst forms of exploitation on the globe is trafficking of human beings. Men, women and children are bought and sold as commodities and forced to cross national and international borders for exploitation. They are being taken away by the way of fraud, abduction, auction, fake marriages, coercion, deception, abuse of power etc. The Indian Constitution specifically bans the traffic in persons and their exploitation. Under the Fundamental Rights section of the Constitution of India, Article 23, prohibits ‘traffic in human beings and other similar forms of forced labour’. Though there is no concrete definition of trafficking, it could be said that trafficking necessarily involves movement / transportation, of a person by means of coercion or deceit, and consequent exploitation leading to commercialization. Trafficking in human beings is considers as criminal and exploiting practices among persons specifically among children and women.

Women are considered to be most vulnerable to human trafficking. For purpose of sexual or commercial exploitation, women and girls are kidnapped, sold, and coerced in every country in the world. Trafficking of women for commercial sexual exploitation has become one of the greatest challenges of the new millennium. It has put into threat the basic dignity of women, exploiting them in the worst manner, destroying them physically, psychologically, socio-economically and in other respects.

One of the most common reasons for trafficking in women today is to fuel the prostitution trade. The women are often raped and abused by their recruiters, and then sent to brothels or underground prostitution rings. They also have to work in the sex industry.

Child trafficking is also high-risk organized crime worldwide. Boys and girls are coerced into forced labour, and being trafficked or exploited for sex trade and pornography, domestic labour, illegal & forced marriages, work in mines and factories by illegal means etc.

This research paper aims at highlighting the aftermath effects of child trafficking, laws on trafficking, loopholes in trafficking, some landmark judgment son trafficking of women and children. The paper will also highlight the need to develop the multidimensional approach to combat this grievous problem.

Key words- exploitation, commodities, organized crime, sexual exploitation, forced labour, slavery

I. WHAT IS HUMAN TRAFFICKING?
Definitions of Human Trafficking
Trafficking is defined in the term traffic as ‘trade, especially illegal’
The most widely accepted definition of human trafficking comes from the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children, which is also known as the Palermo Protocols. Adopted by the UN General Assembly in 2000 and accepted by over 150 countries, the Palermo Protocols\(^1\). The United Nations defines human trafficking as:

“The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation.”

II. THE PROCESS OF TRAFFICKING IN HUMAN BEINGS: PHASES OF COMMITTING THE CRIME

Using the definition of trafficking in human beings from the Palermo Protocols, the phenomenon can be structured in these three phases: recruitment, transport, exploitation.

Phase of Recruitment
At this stage the victim is drawn into the trafficking chain. This occurs mostly through abuse of trust, internet, love, friendship, family ties, misuse of information, abductions, etc. Most victims are recruited through false job and other offers, usually by people the victim knows, simulating a love affair when the boy, after gaining her trust, invites a girl to go together and move to another country or another city to start a joint life. Common forms of recruitment are also job that offers in daily newspapers, social networks, internet and others. It sounds incredible, but the victim's family also sells child because of hardships, poverty, or because of their "customs".

Phase of Transportation
Transport to the place of exploitation, either within the country or outside the country of origin of the victim. While transporting the victim to the final destination false documents are often used but it is possible to use the real documents too.

Phase of Exploitation
This stage involves the exploitation of the victims. Children are involved in the chain of begging, are forced into criminal activity and may be exposed to sexual exploitation. Female persons are usually sexually and work exploited, while adult males are often exploited by working under harsh conditions. To achieve total control and prevent disobedience and escape of the victim, traffickers apply different methods that include the confiscation of personal documents, causing fear and the use of force; blackmail and threats are not rare, as well as the use of force towards the members of the victim’s family.

---

\(^1\) Exodus Cry, ‘What is Human Trafficking?’ Available at: https://exoduscry.com/about/human-trafficking/ (Last Accessed on - June 15, 2019).

\(^2\) Article 3(a) of the Optional Protocol to the United Nations Conventions on Transnational Organised Crime, also known as the Palermo Protocol.
### Identification of Human Trafficking (Process, Means, Purpose)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Process</th>
<th>Means</th>
<th>Purpose</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Recruitment</td>
<td>Threat</td>
<td>Exploitation which includes:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportatio</td>
<td>Force</td>
<td>Prostitution and other forms of social exploitation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transfer</td>
<td>Coercion</td>
<td>Forcible labour and services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harbour</td>
<td>Abduction</td>
<td>Slavery and similar practices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Receipt of</td>
<td>Fraud</td>
<td>Involuntary servitude and removal of organs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persons</td>
<td>Deception</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Abuse of Power</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Abuse of Vulnerability</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Giving and receiving of payments</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: UNODC (This table was shown in the PowerPoint presentation given at the Global Report on Trafficking in Persons launch event at Foreign Correspondents’ Club of Thailand on February 13, 2009).

- Traffickers use a variety of methods to create a vulnerable condition for the victims so that the victim do not have any other choice but obey the traffickers.
- One of the most common methods used by traffickers is debt-bondage in which the traffickers tell their victims that they owe them money relating to their travel and living expenses and that they will not be released until the debt has been repaid.
- Traffickers also use other methods including starvation, imprisonment, physical abuse (beatings and rape), verbal abuse, removal of victims’ identification documents (e.g. passport), and threats of violence to the victims and the victims’ families, and forced drug use.
- Especially in the case of cross-border trafficking, victims often do not speak the local language or do not have any social network to assist them so that they are depending on members of their own ethnic group receiving them in the destination country.
- Furthermore, victims’ illegal status makes it difficult for them to seek help from law enforcement, the healthcare system and/or other public services.

---


III. TYPES OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING

There are many forms of exploitation into which people can be trafficked and held in slavery.

These crimes are happening in every corner of the world and can include any person, regardless of age, socio-economic background or location. As a result, each case can look very different. Below are some of the most commonly reported forms of human trafficking and modern slavery.5

1. Sexual Exploitation

Sexual exploitation entails any non-consensual or abusive sexual act performed without victim’s consent. This includes prostitution, escort work and pornography. Women, men and children of both sexes can be victims. Most of the victims are often deceived with the promise of a better life and then controlled through violence. “There is a culture of silence not because women are okay to put up with it, but because women do not draw enough confidence from the way the issue is going to be dealt with, because those in power continue to be men.” -NISHTHA SATYAM, Deputy Chief of UN Women in India6

2. Forced Labour

Forced labour generally involves victims being compelled to work very long hours. These workers often work in inhuman working conditions without relevant training and equipment. They are also compelled to work beyond their physical and mental capacities. Forced labour vitally implies to the use of coercion for getting the work done. The workers further lack freedom of choice to work. These victims are frequently subjected to verbal threats or violence to achieve compliance.

3. Bonded labour

Bonded labour is a practice in which the employers give loans at high rates of interest to the labour who intern work at low wage rates to pay off their debts. The services and the duration of the services required to repay the debt are often undefined. Such bonded labour practices have a tendency of being passed on from generation to generation until the debts are finally paid off.

4. Domestic servitude

Domestic servitude refers to situations where the victims are forced to work in private households. Their movement is often restricted and they are forced to perform house-keeping tasks over long hours and meagre salaries. Such victims lead very isolated lives and have little or no freedom. Their often work in inhuman conditions and are also subjected to physical violence.

5. Organ harvesting

Organ harvesting basically refers trafficking of functional organs of individuals for transplant on high payments. The illegal trade is dominated by demand for kidneys and

---

liver. These organs can be partly/wholly transplanted with relatively few risks to the life of the donor.

6. Child exploitation
Persons under the age of 18 are classified as children in most of the countries across the world. It is not astonishing to see young people getting caught up in criminal exploitation. Children are vulnerable to exploitation by traffickers and organized crime groups. They are deliberately targeted by criminals, or ruthlessly exploited by the people who should protect them.

IV. EFFECT OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING

1. Emotional Effect- The victims who are trafficked into the commercial sex industry are forced to have sex with many persons are broken with very low self-esteem, ashamed and are very angry if the perpetrator is trusted. Their feeling of severe guilt, depression, anxiety lead them to attempt suicide.

2. Physical/ Health Effect- Victims are physically abused by traffickers. They are capable to carry Sexual Transmitted Infections like HIV/AIDS. Physical torture and deprivation are applied on the victims for taking charge of them and preventing them from escaping.

3. Social Effect- As the victims of trafficking, are unable to lead a family life for a long period and are cutoff from normal social activities possible adjustment for them would be difficult. Their progress is delayed even when all is in place for their rehabilitation and reintegration because of the stigma put on them by the society.

4. Economic Effect- Although human trafficking is a high profit and low risk adventure, the perpetrators mortgage the life of adults and children for their selfish gains. Human Trafficking ruins the future of any society for which a large number of people cannot work effectively. The situation worsens when women and children are most affected.

V. CAUSES OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING
The main causes of Human Trafficking are as follows:-

1. Poverty: Poverty is a major factor in human trafficking industry. The victims look for any means to get out of the curse of poverty. These helpless condition of the victims gives ample scope to the traffickers to entrap the victims in their nets. The traffickers lure the victims with better life facilities by way of moving to foreign countries.

2. Political condition: Political instability, militarism, generalized violence or civil unrest increase in trafficking as well. The destabilization and scattering of population increase their vulnerability to unfair treatment and abuse via trafficking and forced labour.

3. War: A large number of children who have lost their family members in war are vulnerable to trafficking. Armed conflicts lead to massive gross displacement of people.

4. Social and cultural practices: Most of the women and girls are generally exploited and abused due to social and cultural practices and are forced to live in perilous condition. They are more vulnerable to human trafficking as they get little opportunity of upward mobility. In our society a single
mother, divorced woman, widowed and sexually abused woman and young girls are easy prey to the traffickers because of the social stigma.

5. **Demand Of Cheap Labour:** Demand of cheap labour particularly in restaurants and kitchens help traffickers to exploit employees who are often initially promised a safe work space and a steady salary, though they are paid less than minimum wage and are forced to work on overtime. As the victims of trafficking are unable to protest for having very few alternatives, the business owners never cease to practice these illegal norms.

6. **Child Marriage:** In our country child marriage is the easiest way of human trafficking. In village community it is a matter of shame for the poor parents who are unable to arrange the marriage of their daughter. So they easily accept the offer of the traffickers who approach the poor families with marriage proposal without dowry, rather with cash rewards (between Rs. 1000- Rs. 5000 on an average). After marriage, the girls are sold and resold until they reach ultimate destination.

7. **Mutilation:** People are trafficked for their organs, particularly kidneys. It is a rapidly growing field of commercial activity. The life of the victim is at risk as operations are carried out in clandestine conditions with no medical care at all. According to NCRB (2015), 15 cases were registered under the Transplantation of Human Organ Act, 1994 in India.

8. **Sex-Tourism:** In recent time globalization has played an important role for the growth of tourism business and entertainment industries. As a result, sex related trades like sex tourism have grown rapidly.

9. **Child Labor:** Child labour means work performed by a child under the age of 14 for economic purpose. Children are deprived of their childhood and regular attendance to school.

10. **Migration:** Migration means the movement by people from one place to another with an objective mind. When people take irregular means for migration, they are easily victimized by human traffickers which poses a great danger to children and young woman in particular.

VI. **HUMAN TRAFFICKING IN INDIA**

Human trafficking has been a crime for centuries around the world. It is presently the 3rd largest global organized crime after drugs and armed forces, which is growing at an alarming rate. It has become one of the major issues of the twenty first century that has grown at a rapid pace. Human Trafficking is a crime that shapes all. It is a source, destination and transit country for trafficking of persons, including young girls and children. Child victims of trafficking in India are exploited in many ways- including as factory and agricultural workers, domestic servants and beggars. Girls in particular are vulnerable to trafficking for the purpose of forced marriages and commercial sexual exploitation.

**MAGNITUDE OF THE PROBLEM IN INDIA**
National Crime Record Bureau (NCRB) released that in 2016, a total of 8,137 cases of human trafficking were reported from across the country and in 2015, 6,877 cases were reported, an increase of 18% in cases can be noticed here. The motive behind 7,670 cases was sexual exploitation and 162 relates to child pornography. The numbers for human trafficking cases released by the National Crime Records Bureau (NCRB) put Rajasthan at an embarrassing number two position with 1,422 cases registered out of which 279 were females and children’s where 2,519 in which 696 were girls. Total females trafficked are 975.

According to NCRB data, the state’s share stood at 17.49% of the total 8,057 cases registered across the country. Rajasthan tops in the list of victims that were rescued in 2016. The list is topped by West Bengal with 3,579 cases.

In terms of cases reported Rajasthan ranks at 2nd position and in terms of rate Rajasthan ranks at 4th position. The NCRB notes that more minor boys were trafficked than girls. But, on the other hand, among adults, more girls were trafficked compared to boys.

VII. ROLE OF NATIONAL COMMISSION

NHRC on Women and Children

NHRC, India is committed for the protection of human rights of women and children due to their vulnerability in the society and therefore gives prior importance to In India, as elsewhere, women and children confront manifold violations of their human rights and are often discriminated against despite the fact that the Constitution of India provides for their survival, development, protection, participation and empowerment. India is also party to the international conventions which explicitly address the issues and advances human rights of women and children. The conventions were framed to ensure equality in the field of civil and political rights as well as economic, social and cultural rights.

The key international agreement on women’s human rights is the 1979 Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW), which is ratified by 185 UN Member States. CEDAW encompasses a global consensus on the changes that need to take place in order to realize women’s human rights. Likewise, the key international agreement on children’s human rights is the 1989 Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC). The CEDAW was ratified by the Government of India in 1993, whereas the CRC was ratified in 1992. Having ratified the CRC and the CEDAW, its provisions are reflected in numerous policies, laws, schemes and programmes being implemented for children and women by the Government of India.

However, the intergenerational cycle of multiple deprivation and violence faced by girls and women is amply clear by the adverse child sex ratio in children under 6 years of age. Hence it is important to work in the direction so as to provide protective and safe environment for women and children, including those from the most deprived socio-religious communities.

The paragraphs given below highlight some of the important activities undertaken by the Policy Research, Projects and Programmes Division, in short, Research Division of NHRC, on rights of women and children.
A. Constitution of the Core Group on Trafficking, Women and Children. The Commission has constituted a Core Group on Trafficking, Women and Children in November 2016. The Members of the Core Group include experts on the subject representing Central Government, Police, Research Institutes, NGOs and Civil Society Organizations. The first meeting of the Core Group was held on 6 December 2016 under the chairmanship of Shri S. C. Sinha, Member, NHRC. The meeting was held to discuss the agenda prepared on issues related to Trafficking, Women and Children. The Core Group looked into the draft guidelines on Trafficking formulated by the NHRC and decided to re-draft the same. In the subsequent meetings of the Core Group held in the months of April, May and June the Core Group drafted a Standard Operating Procedures (SoP) and Guidelines for Combating Trafficking of Persons in India. The SoP comprises in great detail the concept of Trafficking, Collection of Intelligence for Prevention of Trafficking, Actions to be Taken Before Rescue, Rescue Process, Post-rescue Process, Rehabilitation and Compensation, Monitoring and Accountability, Law Enforcement and Legal Provisions which includes related provisions of Law relating to different aspects of trafficking. The Guidelines further, look to establish a minimum standard in all processes leading to the prevention of trafficking; identification, rescue, repatriation, rehabilitation and prosecution of all the offenders involved. It talks about Resource Allocation, Capacity Building and Monitoring, Accountability and Transparency Mechanisms which needs to be developed for the better implementation of the existing framework.

VIII. ANTI TRAFFICKING BILL 2016

“Slavery was abolished 150 years ago & yet in current scenario there are more people involved in slavery today than at any other time in history”

The 2016 Anti-Trafficking Bill is a proposed bill addition to the existing Indian laws against trafficking. The bill in its current form will not achieve its objectives of preventing trafficking and providing protection and rehabilitation to trafficked victims. This is because there are various sets of laws applicable to the various manifestations of human trafficking: the Indian Penal Code’ the criminal law, the Immoral Trafficking Prevention Act, which is applicable to the contract labour, sex sector, interstate migrant and work several specialist labour legislations covering bonded labour. These different legal sources arise various ideas about what constitutes trafficking or extreme exploitation.

The differences of these approaches are visible in various respects. While the IPC and ITPA are related to prison, laws on bonded


labour, contract labour, migrant labour envisage elaborate local-level administrative and labour law mechanisms. While on the other hand, criminal laws target persons like traffickers, whereas labour laws presume that exploitation is endemic and use both penal and labour law doctrines to impose obligations for better working conditions on all intermediaries.\(^9\) While it is too soon to assess Sections 370 and 370A and the enforcement gap of labour laws despite activist judges, the NHRC and several dedicated IAS officers, it is a painful reminder of indifference on the part of the executive and society towards labour exploitation.

This Bill seeks to build an infrastructure around Sec.370. However, India needs effective and a comprehensive anti-trafficking law that will not only consolidates the varied streams of anti-trafficking laws, but also it will consolidate the very different visions of extreme exploitation and the best regulatory means to address them. Unfortunately, the human trafficking Bill is that piece of legislation that does not consolidates.

GOOD, BUT INEFFECTIVE
The anti-trafficking Bill proposes a separate criminal law infrastructure on Human Trafficking. The district trafficking committee is the first helpline where social actors, governmental and other persons, can report a victim. It is unclear which agency undertakes the raid and rescue, but the victim is housed at the Shelter home where victim is provided food, protection, the special public prosecutor will initiate prosecution in a special court after police investigation of crime.

This raid-rescue-rehabilitation model is stranded in a strong criminal law system with severe penalties, burden of proof reversal, and provisions for take away traffickers by removing their assets and a parallel adjudication machinery consisting of special public prosecutors and special courts.

The Anti-Trafficking Bill thus proposes to make the prosecution of trafficking significant under Section 370. However, the Indian legal system has historically been unable to translate the law into action. The raid-rescue-rehabilitation model built under the ITPA has been a failure, protective homes under the ITPA have resulted in state officials sexually abusing women and colluding with pimps and brothel-keepers.

Compounding the replication of the failed model of rescue and rehabilitation is the complete lack of clarity regarding how the proposed infrastructure is to interact with existing vigilance committees under the bonded labour laws and protective homes under the ITPA. Without any financial commitments from the government, the anti-trafficking bill is an empty gesture, meant to appease modern-day abolitionists and secure a better ranking in the Global Slavery Index, moving it away from its current hotspot status.

Worse, India has a robust history of sex work, policy framers have often seen trafficking purely through the lens of sex trafficking and

sex work – whether it was the changes to the ITPA proposed or the bias in Section 370A towards users of sex trafficked victims. Several provisions of the trafficking bill highlight this continued emphasis on sex work, including the creation of offences under Sections 16 and 17 and rehabilitative measures to facilitate women exit from sex work.

Indian anti-trafficking NGOs are largely anti-sex work abolitionist groups, whereas the organizations which are working against the system of bonded labour find little resonance with the trafficking label. The bill thus seems to be primarily directed at victims of commercial sexual exploitation, a suitable distraction for the government from the millions of men and children severely exploited in, stone quarries, brick kilns, rice mills, construction sites, carpet workshops. The Bill could have consolidated existing statutes and enforcement machinery and lent conceptual coherence to the term trafficking.¹⁰

IX. RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Due to lack of education people are not well aware of their rights. It also lacks public awareness. There should be direct interaction with children regarding their rights. They should be taught their rights in the school and by their parents. The school should build effective programs regarding trafficking and it should be communicated to children via plays, short movies etc. because children learn what they see. Persons involved in trafficking should be strictly punished.

2. In India, only laws are made on papers but their enforcement always lacks behind. Firstly, judiciary should look after the strict application and enforcement of the law. There should be legislative protection for trafficked victim. There should be strengthening of laws made on trafficking. There should be different ways developed by which awareness should be made in society regarding trafficking.

3. As we discussed earlier that poverty was one of the main causes of human trafficking because of which there is lack of education, it is very important that children’s access to education be increased and job opportunities for women be enhanced.

4. As we all know that people with no security or property are not easily provided with loans due to which they migrate to other places in search of better opportunities, government should provide flexible financing and access to credit, including microcredit at low interest.

5. During our entire research we came to know that all laws in India related to trafficking were for victim there was no law for the trafficker so we must have a law with stringent punishment and fines for the trafficker.

6. State should provide funding to establish Fast Track Courts that deals with all forms of human trafficking.

7. Subjects of child sexual abuse and trafficking should be included in the course curriculum.

¹⁰ Ibid.
8. Government should establish “Anti Human Trafficking Units” in all districts to prevent Human Trafficking.

9. Identification of victims and survivors and any intervention above all should do no further harm to any child or adolescent.

10. Member of state should ensure regular awareness raising and training for all the actors likely to come into contact with trafficked persons, especially the front-line police forces and other relevant officials.

11. The Supreme Court should lead the nation in implementation part of legal framework provided for combating the evil of human Trafficking rather than giving mere directives. The Supreme Court should effectively direct the implementation of existing laws by upholding constitutional norms, and recommend changes if existing laws are inadequate.

12. The Supreme Court should protect the various rights of the trafficked women and girls, such as freedom of movement, the right to life, the right not to be deported, the right not to be discriminated against or stigmatized, and the right to essential services.

13. There is extensive need in all over the world to bring all the agencies working in the field of fight against trafficking to come together and give helping hands to each other in the fight.

14. A number of programs at National and International level should be arranged to address the causes of human trafficking. On a larger scale, host a human trafficking film festival.

15. The National Human Right Commission should conduct the extensive and valuable research throughout the country, organized a national workshop, and also contribute towards the implementation of the trafficking of law. The Government should also provide for shelters and schooling for orphans and street children to keep them away from traffickers.

16. Everybody must incorporate human trafficking information into their professional association, conferences, training, manuals, and other materials as relevant.

**CONCLUSION**

Trafficking is a complex phenomenon and it is viewed with different perspective, and the problem lies with the socio-economic conditions, legal factors, and poverty the major cause of trafficking. Human trafficking means buying and selling of humans as a commodity. Do you think we humans can be bought and sold as a commodity in the market? The reality of human trafficking is very saddening. The problem lies with the fact that culprit is trafficker about whom relatively little is known. This has to urgently given consideration as it is expanding unsteadily and it is a fundamental violation of human rights of the victim.

Literature on trafficking in India is completely dominated by the issue of commercial sexual exploitation, so much so that trafficking as a distinct separate crime does not get highlighted. At times is almost reduced to insignificance in comparison to commercial sexual exploitation. Even though there seems to be considerable information available, one is unable to form a picture.
which reflects the reality of trafficking in women and children in India.
To get the practical knowledge about the subject, I visited few NGOs, organization who are working really well to combat the human trafficking in India. I visited Sneh Aangan which is a one stop crisis center for children victims. Children are bought here and their counselling is done. FIR is also filed here only. The victims are not called to the police station. The police personnel visits the victims in civil dress. Then I visited TAABAR, Jaipur which is a shelter home for children. The victims are rehabilitated here. The victims are given proper education. They are always kept busy. Then I visited Railway Childline. Railway Childline (1098) is a wonderful imitative of the Railways. The childline through outreach tries to find out about the victims and traffickers.

The problem of the Human Trafficking is very huge. Human Trafficking is increasing at an alarming rate. As a budding lawyer, academicians, researchers, teachers etc., we should work to combat human trafficking.

*****